



**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF OCTOBER 17, 2008
State Treasurers' Board Room, Richard H. Austin Building
430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan**

CALL TO ORDER: The October 17, 2008 meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room in the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member (arrived at 9:52 a.m.)
Maxine J. McClelland, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the September 19, 2008 meeting of the State Assessors Board as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT: There was no public comment.

FINANCIAL REPORTS:

1. The Board reviewed revised State Assessors Board financial reports for the 2006-2007 fiscal year.
2. The Board reviewed State Assessors Board financial reports for the month of August 2008.
3. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved that the certification renewal fees of staff serving the Board be paid using State Assessors Board restricted funds.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1. A communication from the Executive Secretary regarding evaluations of the 2007-2008 mandatory renewal program was reviewed by the Board.
2. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve a request for three hours of elective educational renewal credit for a program titled "Basic ECF Calculation Using the Equalizer Software System" by the Antrim County equalization director.
3. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to approve the requests for six hours of elective educational renewal credit and Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) renewal credit for USPAP programs by the Oakland County Association of Assessing Officers and the Northeast Michigan Assessors Association.

4. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to allow the Executive Secretary to approve administratively any 2008-2009 USPAP renewal request.
5. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 3 experience qualification requests of Mr. Charles Olney and Ms. Daina Norden.

CERTIFICATION LEVEL MATTERS:

1. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to allow the certification of Mr. William M. White to be reinstated for 2008 following payment by Mr. White of penalty fees as specified in the Board's late renewal session completions policy/procedure and contingent upon Mr. White meeting the continuing education requirements for the 2006-2007 renewal period.
2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to allow the certification of Mr. John R. Krueger to be reinstated for 2008 following payment by Mr. Krueger of penalty fees as specified in the Board's late renewal session completions policy/procedure and contingent upon Mr. Krueger meeting the continuing education requirements for the 2006-2007 renewal period.

CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law (MCL) 15.268(a) and 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii), 15.243(1)(d), 15.243(1)(g), and 15.243(1)(k) and the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.267(2).) A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Patel to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, McClelland—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0018
2. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0025
3. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0027
4. Discussion of an assessing practices matter (the matter starting on page P296 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for October 17, 2008)
5. Discussion of an assessing practices matter (the matter starting on page P381 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for October 17, 2008)
6. Discussion of an assessing practices matter (the matter starting on page P505 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for October 17, 2008)
7. Discussion of the closed meeting minutes from September 19, 2008
8. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0031
9. Discussion of a certification reinstatement request

10. Discussion of legal advice relating to revocation petitions 08-0020 and 08-0021
11. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0030
12. Discussion of narrative appraisal 199
13. Discussion of narrative appraisal 200
14. Discussion of September 2008 course examination results
15. Discussion of the second grading appeal for narrative appraisal 195
16. Discussion of a narrative appraisal grader reinstatement request
17. Discussion of narrative appraisal review records

A motion was made by McClelland and seconded by Patel to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:

1. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to accept the letter of withdrawal from the State Tax Commission with regard to revocation petition 08-0018. Morgan recused himself with respect to this matter.
2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to adopt the closed meeting minutes of September 19, 2008 as presented.
3. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to schedule a formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0025.
4. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to schedule a formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0027.
5. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 08-0031.
6. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to grant a certification reinstatement request pending passage of the level 1 certification examination by the individual making the request and following an interview before the Board.
7. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to request Assessment and Certification Division staff to investigate revocation petition allegations contained in revocation petitions 08-0020 and 08-0021.
8. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 08-0030.

9. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to commence a revocation proceeding on the Board's own initiative and schedule an informal revocation hearing for the assessing practices matter described starting on page P296 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for October 17, 2008.

10. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to commence a revocation proceeding on the Board's own initiative and schedule an informal revocation hearing for the assessing practices matter described starting on page P381 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for October 17, 2008.

11. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved (1) to commence a revocation proceeding on the Board's own initiative for the assessing practices matter described starting on page P505 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for October 17, 2008, (2) to request the State Tax Commission to have mini-reviews conducted for the two local units where the assessing officer involved is the assessor of record, and (3) to schedule an informal revocation hearing for this matter.

12. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the grader's passing grade for narrative appraisal 199 and to schedule an oral examination for the level 4 candidate involved.

13. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve the grader's failing grade for the second submission of narrative appraisal 200.

14. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to accept the recommendation of the independent reviewer regarding the appeal of the second grading of narrative appraisal 195.

OTHER BUSINESS: It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the official position of the Board on the subject of the Board's authority in revocation proceedings as presented, to publish the position on the Board's Web page, and to request publication of the position in the Michigan Assessors Association monthly magazine.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for November 13, 2008 at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room of the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, in Lansing.

ADJOURNMENT: It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 11:31 a.m.

Date minutes typed: October 26, 2008

Date minutes approved: 11-13-08



Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson